Taxation and profitability of small and medium enterprises in Calabar South Local Government Area, Cross River State, Nigeria.

Ifere, Eugene Okoi[1], Okon, Maurice Asengita[2], Ibiang, Omini Ebri[3], Eja, Christy Ebinehita[4]
Department of Economics, University of Calabar, Calabar
[1]eugeoifere@gmail.com, ORCID: 0000-0002-6516-5389
[2]mauriceasengita@gmail.com
[3]ibiangomini28@gmail.com
[4]tianabanks@yahoo.co.uk

Abstract

The study examined the impact of taxation on small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) in Calabar South Local Government Area of Cross River State. Three objectives and hypothesis were formulated to guide the study. The survey design was employed and primary data was collected from two hundred respondents who were randomly selected. The primary data were analysed using simple percentage while the three hypotheses were tested using chi-square (X^2) at 0.05 level of significance. Findings from the Chi-square results showed that multiple taxation constitute a major challenge to the performance of SMEs in Calabar South and government is not accountable for taxes on SMEs in Calabar South. Based on the findings, the study recommended that Government should formulate a policy that will reduce illegal taxation on the small and medium enterprises in the country. Furthermore, for Small and Medium Enterprises to get better equipped, have enough funds and survive in a competitive market, the rate of tax levied on the these enterprises should be reduced and Government should design tax policies aimed at encouraging growth and development of SMEs.

Keywords: Taxation; Profitability; Small and medium enterprises (SMEs)

Introduction

Entrepreneurial activities are the major thrust for economic growth which is essential for sustainable development of developing countries. The underpinning foundation for entrepreneurship is small and medium scale businesses which serve as a driving force for employment generation, poverty reduction income generation and innovation. Small and Medium Enterprises make up about 95% of the entire economy and they serve as source of employment generation, innovation, competition, economic dynamism which ultimately lead to poverty alleviation and economic growth (Ocheni, 2015). Tax policy is one of the factors that constitute these Small and medium enterprises in the economic environment. Tax payment is a mandatory contribution imposed by the government on personal income earners, companies, investors, exporters, importers etc. Revenue realized from taxation is a major source of revenue to the government of Nigeria, and as such is an important tool used in the development of Nigeria and her economy. Taxation is a means by which government increase or diversifies their revenue in accordance to the law, used to promote welfare, provide infrastructure and security. The state has the right to impose and demand contribution upon persons, corporation's properties, or rights for the purpose of generating revenues for public purposes, this power is inherent in taxation achieved through legislation. The power of taxation is based upon the theory that no government can exist or stand without taxation, thus taxation is an utmost necessity. Taxation has always been an issue for the government and taxpayers alike from the early years of civilization, Eftekhari (2009). The issue of taxation has generated a lot of controversy and severe political conflicts over time. Taxation is seen as a burden which every citizen must bear to sustain his or her government because the government has certain functions to perform for the benefits of those it governs.

Tax policies have a great impact on the growth of SMEs, and government support plays a vital role in their contribution to the economy. If the tax structure is not adequately designed to the specific environmental conditions, it may create a burden for SMEs to comely. The majority of small businesses are less likely to attain or maintain their growing profitability due to operational factors, including tax policies. This implies that as a policy maker and regulator, Government must consider the factors that could affect the competitiveness of the small

enterprises. And avoid corruption and ineffective tax governance, among others which (Ifere, et al 2023) identified as reasons for tax evasion.

Considering the strategic role small and medium enterprises plays in the economy and its volatile nature, it is pertinent taxation and profitability of SMEs be analysed in other to answer the following questions: Does multiple taxation affect the profitability of SMEs? What tax incentives should SMEs enjoy? How can tax policies be designed to grow SMEs and what is the most effective ways to administer them? Given the paradoxical relationship between taxation and SMEs in Calabar South, the question this study will attempt to provide answers to include; How does multiple taxation affect the profitability of SMEs in Calabar South? Are Government accountable for taxes among SMEs in Calabar South? The broad objective of the study is to examine taxation and profitability on small and medium scale enterprises in Calabar South. The specific objectives are ascertained whether multiple taxation affects the performance and profitability of SMEs in Calabar South and whether the Government is accountable for taxes among SMEs in Calabar South. The paper is structured into five sections. After this introductory section, section two reviews related literature. The methodology is discussed in the third section. Section four comprises results and discussion of findings, and finally, section five draws conclusions based on the findings and recommends the way forward.

Literature review

Taxation

Taxation is one of the sources of income for government, such income as used to finance or run public utilities and perform other social responsibilities, Farayola (1987). Ochiogu (1994) defined tax as a levy imposed by the government against the income, profit or wealth of the individuals and corporate organizations. Taxation is the most important source of revenue for modern governments, typically accounting for ninety percent or more of their income,Adams (2001) . Taxation is seen by Aguolu (2004), as a compulsory levy by the government through its agencies on the income, consumption and capital of its subjects. These levies are made on personal income, such as salaries, business profits, interests, dividends, discounts and royalties. It is also levied against company's profits petroleum profits, capital gains and capital transfer. Whereas, Ojo (2008) stresses that, taxation is a concept and the science of imposing tax on citizens. According to him, tax is itself a compulsory levy which is required to be paid by every citizen. It is generally considered as a civic duty. The imposition of taxation is expected to yield income which should be utilized in the provision of amenities, both social and security and creates conditions for the economic wellbeing of the society. Okon (1997) states that income tax can be regarded as a tool of fiscal policy used by government all over the world to influence positively or negatively particular type of economic activities in order to achieve desired objectives. The primary economic goals of developing countries are to increase the rate of economic growth and hence per capita income, which leads to a higher standard of living.

Small and medium scale enterprise

The concept and definition of small and medium scale enterprise is dynamic in character and varies with time and also varies among institutions and countries. Notwithstanding, the basic definitional parameters are the same. They include number of employees, Assets and turnover. It is evident around the world that small and medium scale enterprise provide an effective means of stimulating indigenous entrepreneurship, enhancing greater employment opportunities per unit of capital invested and aiding the development of local technology (Sule, 1986).

Small scale enterprise: An enterprise with a labour size of 11-100 workers or a total cost of not more than 50 million including working capital but excluding cost of land (Sule, 1986:207). Cross (2019) investigated the Effects of Multiple Taxation on Small/Medium Enterprises in Nigeria", the objective of this study to examine the relationship between multiple taxation and SMEs survival, and to find out the effects of multiple taxation on 'the growth and development of small/medium scale enterprise. Descriptive statistics was used to study the questionnaire. The study showed that the mortality rate of Small and medium enterprises which make up 95% of the economy is very high and that tax policy is one of the factors that constitutes the small business economic environment.

In a related study, Chidioka, Muhammed , and Halima Shuaib , (2022) assessed the effect of multiple taxations on Small and Medium-Scale Enterprises (SMEs)' performance in Kaduna State, Nigeria. A cross-sectional descriptive survey research strategy was adopted in which 441 SMEs out of over 8,000 in the State surveyed. The primary data collected was analysed using partial least square structural equation modeling PLS-SEM with the aid of SmartPLS 3. The findings show that multiple taxations harm SMEs business performance in Kaduna, Nigeria. Afuberoh and Okoye (2014) investigated the Impact of Taxation on Revenue Generation in Nigeria: A Study of Federal Capital Territory and Selected States. They adopted also primary sources of data to present and analyse the information for the study. The testing of the hypotheses of the study was done using regression analysis computed with the aid of SPSS version 17.0. The found out that among others that, taxation has a significant contribution to revenue generation and taxation has a significant contribution on Gross Domestic Product (GDP).

Bismark, Joy, Evans and Isaac (2016)investigated on Tax Policy, SMEs Compliance, Perception and Growth Relationship in Ghana. They used survey to administer using questionnaire and a total of 200 respondents were used with 50 respondents from each market. Multiple regression analysis was also employed in this study. They found out that that majority of the respondent's perceived adverse impact of tax policies on SMES compliance, growth and perception in Ghana. The findings will be beneficial to stakeholders in reforming measures to bridge tax policies to SMES in an efficient and effective manner. Emmanuel and Daniya (2012) adopted the use of questionnaires to investigate the development of Small and Medium Scale Enterprise. It was discovered that financial institutions provide the necessary financial lubricant that facilitate the development of Small and Medium Scale Enterprises, but, a lot still need to be done by the government in terms of policy formulation in order to complement the efforts of financial institutions.

The Challenges of Financing Micro, Small and Medium Scale Enterprises (MSMEs) in Nigeria was examined by Awoyemi, Olayoriju and Kashim (2014) . They employed descriptive analysis and deductive method to describe the financing problems experienced by the MSMEs. They found out that most financial institutions such as Deposit Money Banks (DMBs), Microfinance Banks (MFBs) among others regard most MSMEs as high risk borrowers with no credit worthiness. The informal nature of most MSMEs as they are not duly registered enterprises make financial institutions reluctant to advance loans to them.

An attempt to investigate the Impact of Government Interventions on Small Scale Enterprises in Mubi North Local Government Area, Adamawa State, Nigeria was made by (Aliyu, 2013) . Data were collected through interviews and questionnaires. Percentage and Chi - square techniques were used to describe and analyse the results obtained from the field. However, the result indicates that government intervention schemes/ programmes aimed at elevating the SMEs to the expected targets in the area, lacks the awareness of the SMEs

operators. Again, the available data shows that accessibility to the intervention by SMEs operators is not easy.

Theoretical review

The cost theory of taxation

The cost theory is alternatively called purchase theory of taxation. According to the cost of service principle, every person should contribute in taxes, the actual cost of the service of which he is a beneficiary. This theory is mainly associated with the name of the German economist Van Hock. The cost of service theory seems to be very simple, but it has many drawbacks. The main defect of this theory is the impossibility of measuring the cost of government services on a personal basis. The cost of services of police cannot be allocated to each individual on the basis of services rendered by police to each. In recent times, the government is undertaking a number of welfare functions to improve the economic conditions of poor and downtrodden sections of the society who are unable to pay the cost. So, for them, the cost of service principle will not be useful as a basis for modem revenue system. Moreover, the basic feature of taxation is the absence of quid pro quo which invalidates the theory.

The benefit theory of taxation

This theory is also called the "Value of Service Principle". The benefit theory states that every individual should pay in the form of taxes according to the worth of the service he has received from the state. The relationship between taxpayers and government is seen in quid pro quo terms and the tax payment becomes voluntary. The theory thus places the government in a semi-commercial position. Hence, the rules of the market are applied to the government sector. It gives simultaneous determination of the tax level and the required level of government expenditure. Musgrave observes that this approach to taxation was widely accepted among the political theorists of the 17th century. According to political theorists, such as Locke, Hume, Hobbes and Rousseau, tax was a price paid for the services provided by the state. This was a natural complement to the social contract theory of the state. The main objective of the contract was protection and taxes were a price for protection.

Adam Smith also advocated the benefit principle in enunciating the first maxim of taxation that "The subjects of every state ought to contribute towards the support of the government, as nearly as possible in proportion to their respective abilities, that is, in proportion to the revenue which they respectively enjoy under the protection of the state". It seems that Adam Smith proposes ability as well as benefit considerations. However, he should be placed in the benefit camp because he offers a clear-cut rule that the cost of public outlay should be distributed according to benefit.

In the 19th century, however, economists such as McCulloch and Theirs proposed a narrow interpretation of the functions of the state. Since taxes are paid for protection only, government expenditure should remain confined to those spheres which provide protection. That is why; Ricardo considered public expenditure as a wasteful phenomenon and proclaimed that: "The very best of all plans of finance is to spend little".

The ability to pay theory of taxation

The most important principle of taxation is the ability to pay approach which treats revenue and expenditure of the government separately. According to the ability to pay principle, contribution of the taxpayers made towards public goods is independent of benefits accruing from such goods. This approach considers the tax liability without quid pro quo. Taxes are then compulsory payments based on the ability to pay.

This theory is based on the broad assumption that those who possess income or wealth should contribute to the support of the government, according to their relative abilities. The obligation to pay to the government is taken as a social or collective responsibility although the question of who shall pay and in what amount is necessarily an individualised one. Those who have means to pay should pay and those who have not need not to pay. The principle of ability to pay has a long history. In fact this principle is older than the benefit principle. In the first half of the 16th century Guicciardini suggested progressive taxation based on faculty, but Bodin advocated the proportional taxation toward the end of that century. Since then, this principle was amended and restated by numerous economists.

William Petty and Adam Smith in fact combined the ability to pay principle with the benefit principle of taxation. John Stuart Mill was also an ardent supporter of this principle. Mill categorically rejected the benefit principle based on contract and protection. Mill saw that the benefit principle led on toward a regressive tax structure since the need of protection is more for the poor. Thus, largely on account of its demerits, Mill had abandoned the principle of benefit.

From the summary, several studies have been carried out on the impact of taxation on economic growth in Nigeria or the impact of SMEs in Nigeria. However, no study has been carried out to examine the impact of taxation on SMEs in Calabar South. The aspects of the subject matter which have so far not been addressed are the gaps in knowledge which this study seeks to fill.

Methodology

Research design

Research design is a kind of blue print that guides the researcher in his or her investigation: a format which the researcher employs in order to systematically apply the scientific method in the investigation of the problems. This work will employ an exploratory survey research design. This suit the purpose and it is appropriate for the study, in examining the impact of taxation on small and medium scale enterprises in Calabar South.

Sampling techniques and sample size determination

The sample for this study is based on the registered small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) in Calabar South. The researcher used random sampling techniques. The questionnaire will be used as the major instrument of sample size determination. The sample size frame shall consist of the number of small and medium scale enterprises in Calabar South. The sample size is determined as follows:

Using Yaro's Yamane formula

$$n = \frac{N}{1+N(e)^2}$$

Where n = Sample size

N = Population (No of selected SMEs in Calabar South)

e = Margin of error

For instance, with a margin of error of 5% and a population of 500 SMEs in

Calabar South, sample size can be determined.

Where:

n = ?

N = 500

e = 5%

$$n = \frac{500}{1+500(0.05)^2}$$

$$n = \frac{500}{1+1.25}$$

$$n = \frac{500}{2.25}$$

n = 222.22

n $\cong$ 220

Method of data analysis

The data collected from interview and questionnaires were presented intables. The data collected were analysed by using percentage and inferential statistics. The chi-square (x^2) distributed was the statistical tool used in testing the acceptability or otherwise of the hypothesis posed for this study. The calculated values were compared with the tabulated values. The null hypothesis (Ho) is accepted, when the calculated value is less than the tabulated value and equally the alternative (H_1) are accepted, on the rejection of the null hypothesis that is when the calculated chi-square value is greater than the tabulated value. The calculated values used with the following formula:

$$X^2 = \sum \frac{(OF-EF)^2}{EF}$$

Where

X^2 = Chi-Square

OF = Observed Frequency

EF = Expected Frequency

$\sum$ = the Sum

Expected value of classes of response level of significance (α) of freedom, (df) = (r-1) (c -1)

Where df = degree of freedom

r = number of rows

c = number of columns

Results and discussions

Data presentation, interpretation and analyses

This section supplies analysis of data collected through the questionnaires distributed and retrieved in order to examine the impact of taxation on SMEs in Calabar South. The responses were collected and chi-square method adopted in analysing the responses and testing the hypothesis. A total of two hundred and twenty (220) copies of the questionnaires were

administered out of which two hundred (200) copies representing (91%) of the questionnaire were properly completed and retrieved while thirty (20) copies representing (9%) were not retrieved. The rest of the section provides the result of socio economic questions posed to the respondents and discussion of data analysis of responses from the two hundred and twenty (200) responses that were properly filled, completed and retrieved through the research instruments adopted.

Table 1: Analysis of response rate

S/N	Administered questionnaire	Frequency	Percentage
1.	Returned	200	91%
2.	Unreturned	20	9%
Total		220	100%

Source: Field Survey, 2024

Presentation and analysis of data

Table 2: Chi square analysis of multiple taxation and performance of SMEs

To ascertain whether multiple taxation constitute a major challenge in the performance of SMEs in Calabar South.

Value	Major Challenge n(%)	Not a major challenge n(%)	Test value	P-value
SME business grow where there is multiple taxation?				
Strongly Agree	18(12.1)	22(43.1)	77.944	0.000
Agree	11(7.4)	18(35.3)		
Undecided	1(0.7)	5(9.8)		
Disagree	46(30.8)	4(7.8)		
Strongly disagree	73(49.0)	2(3.9)		
Total	149(100)	51(100)		
Taxation does not have an effect on the growth of SMEs in Calabar South				
Strongly Agree	85(57.0)	10(19.6)	60.162	0.000
Agree	32(21.5)	3(5.9)		
Undecided	0(0.0)	10(19.6)		
Disagree	11(7.4)	8(15.7)		
Strongly disagree	21(14.1)	20(39.2)		
Total	149(100)	51(100)		
Multiple taxation provides an enabling environment for SMEs to strive				
Strongly Agree	13(8.7)	16(31.4)	60.162	0.000
Agree	4(2.7)	14(27.5)		
Undecided	1(0.7)	5(9.8)		
Disagree	49(32.9)	7(13.7)		
Strongly disagree	82(55.0)	9(17.6)		
Total	149(100)	51(100)		
Taxation is not solely the major challenge faced by the SMEs in Calabar South				
Strongly Agree	57(38.3)	11(21.6)	16.974	0.005
Agree	19(12.8)	16(31.4)		
Undecided	14(9.4)	10(19.6)		
Disagree	43(28.9)	8(15.7)		
Strongly disagree	15(10.1)	6(15.7)		
Total	149(100)	51(100)		
Double taxation is one of the factors militating against SMEs tax compliance				
Strongly Agree	105(70.5)	18(35.3)	59.222	0.000
Agree	38(25.5)	8(15.7)		
Undecided	2(1.3)	6(11.8)		
Disagree	2(1.3)	7(13.7)		
Strongly disagree	2(1.3)	12(23.5)		
Total	149(100)	51(100)		

The p-value of the above table shows the level of significance of < 0.05. Therefore, the null hypothesis is rejected and the alternative hypothesis accepted which states that multiple taxation constitutes a major challenge in the performance of SMEs in Calabar South. This findings reinforces the findings of Cross (2019) and that of Chidoka, Mohammed and Halima (2022) which stressed that multiple taxation goes a long way in hampering the performances of small and medium scale enterprises due to the various taxes imposed on the small and medium scale enterprises.

Table 3: Chi square analysis of government accountability and performance of SMEs

To ascertain whether the Government is accountable for taxes among SMEs in Calabar South.				
Value	Accountable n(%)	Not Accountable n(%)	Test value	P-value
Multiple Taxes makes it difficult for SMEs to grow				
Strongly Agree	100(61.3)	5(13.5)	93.111	0.000
Agree	52(31.9)	5(13.5)		
Undecided	0(0.0)	6(16.2)		
Disagree	4(2.5)	13(35.1)		
Strongly disagree	7(4.3)	8(21.6)		
Total	163(100)	37(100)		
SMEs may flourish if given tax relief by the government				
Strongly Agree	93(57.1)	5(13.5)	111.207	0.000
Agree	65(39.9)	5(13.5)		
Undecided	0(0.0)	7(18.9)		
Disagree	3(1.8)	12(32.4)		
Strongly disagree	2(1.2)	8(21.6)		
Total	163(100)	37(100)		
Government mode of collection encourages remittances.				
Strongly Agree	27(16.6)	9(24.3)	32.799	0.000
Agree	101(62.0)	5(13.5)		
Undecided	15(9.2)	8(21.6)		
Disagree	14(8.6)	9(24.3)		
Strongly disagree	6(3.7)	6(16.2)		
Total	163(100)	37(100)		
If Tax revenue from SMEs is used to provide infrastructure, SMEs will thrive				
Strongly Agree	4(2.5)	9(24.3)	44.409	0.000
Agree	0(0.0)	0(0.0)		
Undecided	0(0.0)	4(10.8)		
Disagree	72(44.2)	14(37.8)		
Strongly disagree	87(53.4)	10(27.0)		
Total	163(100)	37(100)		

The p-value of the above table shows the level of significance of < 0.05. Therefore, the null hypothesis is accepted and the alternative hypothesis rejected which states that government is not accountable for taxes from SMEs in Calabar South

Conclusions and recommendations

This study examines taxation and profitability of SMEs in Calabar South. Based on the findings, the study concluded that multiple taxation constitute a major challenge in the performance of SMEs in Calabar South, poor financing is a major challenge in the performance of SMEs in Calabar South and government is not accountable for taxes from SMEs in Calabar South. Furthermore, the study also reveals that the best tax policy needs to be designed such

that the tax rates are appropriate and rational, the exemptions are lower in amount and the tax collection organizations are more efficient. The factors militating against SMEs tax compliance include; double taxation, lack of tax education for SMEs operators, no professional tax consultancy, weak tax planning, high taxation cost, Low efficiency, high collection charges, waste of time for taxpayers and the staff, and the low amounts of received taxes and the deviation of optimum allocation of resources are some of the factors militating against SMEs tax compliance. Sequel to the findings from the study, the researchers make the following recommendations:

1. Government should formulate policies that will reduce illegal taxation on the small and medium enterprises in the country.

2. For Small and Medium Enterprises to get better equipped, have enough funds and survive in a competitive market, the rate of tax levied on these enterprises should be reduced.

3. Government should design tax policies aimed at encouraging SMEs growth and development in the state.

References

Afuberoh, D., & Okoye, E. (2014). The impact of taxation on revenue generation in Nigeria: A study of Federal Capital Territory and selected states. *International Journal of Public Administration and Management Research (IJPAMR), 2*(2).

Aguolu, O. (2004). *Taxation and tax management in Nigeria* (3rd ed.). Meridan Associates.

Aliyu, A. J. (2013). *Impact of government interventions on small scale enterprises in Mubi North Local Government Area, Adamawa State, Nigeria.*

Alonge, S. (1992). Managing your enterprise to maturity. *Business Times*, May 25.

Boswell, J. (1973). *The rise and decline of small firms.* George Allen & Unwin.

Callaway, A. (1975). *Nigeria enterprises and the employment of youth: A study of 225 businesses in Ibadan.* Ibadan University Press.

Chibundu, I. (2006). Strategies for Nigeria SMEs to grow economy. Retrieved from http://blog.Emcnet.com/voip-enterprisetrucnet/strategies-for-Nigerian-smes-to-grow-economy

Clifford, B. (1972). *Basic small business management.* University Press.

Chidioka, M., & Shuaib, H. (2022). Effect of multiple taxation on the performance of small and medium-scale enterprises in Kaduna State, Nigeria. *Alingo Journal of Social and Management Sciences, 4*(2).

Cross, O. D. (2019). Effect of multiple taxation on small/medium enterprises in Nigeria. *International Journal of Advanced Research and Publications, 3*(4), 26. Retrieved from www.ijarp.org

Daniel, L. (2024). *Small and midsize enterprises.* Retrieved from https://www.investopedia.com/terms/s/smallandmidsizeenterprises.asp

Dennis, H., Tootelian, R., & Gaedeke, R. M. (1976). *Small business management.* Year Publishing Company.

Farayola, G. O. (1987). *Guide to Nigerian taxation.* All Group Nigeria Limited.

Festus, O. O., & Akintayo, A. A. (2019). Tax revenue and budget implementation in Nigeria. *American Journal of Industrial and Business Management, 9*(5).

Julia, K. (2024). *Taxation.* Retrieved from https://www.investopedia.com/terms/t/taxation.asp

Ifedi, V. (1992). Survival strategy for small scale industries. *Business Times*, April 20.

Ifere, E. O., Ovat, O. O., Owan, E. J., Chijioke, M. I., Ofem, L. U., Ndome, J. N., Ugbaka, M. A., & Atelhe, A. G. (2023). Perception and criminality of tax evasion in a developing economy. *Corporate Law & Governance Review, 5*(2), 164–173. https://doi.org/10.22495/clgrv5i2sip3

International Tax Dialogue. (2007). *Taxation of small and medium enterprises: Background paper for the International Tax Dialogue Conference.*

Jarret, H. R. (1977). *Geography of manufacturing* (2nd ed.). Macdonald and Evans.

Jialu, L. S. (2022). *How do tax policies affect individuals and businesses?* Retrieved from https://siepr.stanford.edu/publications/policy-brief/how-do-tax-policies-affect-individuals-and-businesses

Masha, R. A. (1986). Self-reliance and small-scale enterprises: The Central Bank's role. *Bullion, 10*(2).

Mba, O. A., & Cletus, I. E. (2014). Issues, challenges, and prospects of small and medium-scale enterprises (SMEs) in Port-Harcourt City, Nigeria. *European Journal of Sustainable Development, 3*(1), 101-114.

Moh, R. (1991). The future of small-scale business in Nigeria. *Savanna Bank News, 6*(4).

Ocheni, S. I. (2015). Impact analysis of tax policy and the performance of small and medium-scale enterprises in the Nigerian economy. *American Research Institute for Policy Development Strategic Management, 3*(1), 71-94.

Oni, E. O., & Daniya, A. A. (2012). Development of small and medium-scale enterprises: The role of government and other financial institutions. *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review (Oman Chapter), 1*(7).

Onyemelukwe, C. C. (1976). *Problem of industrial planning and management in Nigeria.* William Clowes and Sons.

PwC. (2020). *MSME Survey.* Retrieved from https://www.pwc.com/ng/en/assets/pdf/pwc-msme-survey-2020-final.pdf

SMEDAN. (2004). *Small and medium-scale enterprises development agency: Government fiscal and macroeconomic policies. Small Business Journal, 2*(232).

Sule, E. I. K. (1986). Small-scale industries in Nigeria: Concept, appraisal of government policies, and suggested solutions to identified problems. *Central Bank of Nigeria Economic and Financial Review, 24*(4), 6-8.

Tootelian, D. (1976). *Small business management.* Year Publishing Company.

Uzowulu, V. C. (1987). Analyzing the problems of small-scale business firms.

World Bank. (1989). *World Bank statistical bulletin.*

World Trade Center Abuja. (2023). *Small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs): An assessment of their inclusion in Nigeria trade.* Retrieved from https://www.wtcabuja.com/latest-news/trade-services/small-and-medium-sized-enterprises-smes-an-assessment-to-its-inclusion-in-nigeria-trade

Uwaoma, I. (2016). The impact of tax incentives on economic development in Nigeria (Evidence of 2004 – 2014). *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management (UK), 4*(3), 686. Retrieved from http://ijecm.co.uk/